

CITY OF JERSEY CITY

Department of Housing, Economic Development & Commerce
Division of City Planning



Interdepartmental Memorandum

DATE: 1/8/2024
TO: Historic Preservation Commission
FROM: Maggie O'Neill, Senior Historic Preservation Specialist
CC: Jonathan Rekstad, Esq., HPC Counsel
Nelson Benavides, RA, Applicant
Michael and Lauren Burrows, Owners
/File
RE: Case #H-23-0170
80 Sussex Street
Block: 10105/4
Zone: H / Hamilton Park Historic District

I. PLANS AND DOCUMENTS REVIEWED

1. Historic Preservation Application, submitted November 13, 2023
2. Architectural Plans by Nelson Benavides, RA, most recently revised 11-17-2023 entitled *Burrows-Abdelmessih Residence Single Family Townhouse Rear Yard Addition 217 Pavonia Ave Jersey City NJ 07302*
3. Owner Verification Form, submitted November 13, 2023
4. Proposed Scope of Work (undated)
5. Photos of Front and Rear Façade (undated)

II. PROJECT & PROPOSAL BACKGROUND

The property has been owned by Lauren and Michael Burrows (herein referred to as "The Owner") since August 2023. The property is currently a four-unit residence.

6. Per the submitted application and plans prepared by Nelson Benavides, RA, most recently revised 11-17-2023 entitled *Burrows-Abdelmessih Residence Single Family Townhouse Rear Yard Addition 217 Pavonia Ave Jersey City NJ 07302*, the applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a three-story rear addition, façade restoration, and interior renovations floor at a contributing, altered, three-story Italianate influenced Renaissance Revival rowhouse, built circa 1875.

The application and submitted plans were deemed complete by HPC Staff on December 14, 2023.

III. PROPERTY LOCATION & JURISDICTION

217 Pavonia Ave (herein referred to as "The Property") is located in the Hamilton Park Historic District. The property is located on a 22 x 100 lot fronting Pavonia Ave between Erie Street and

Grove Street. As defined in the City of Jersey City Zoning Ordinance, the property is zoned as H.

The property was designated within the Hamilton Park Historic District on February 1, 1977, as well as on the on the National and State Registers of Historic Places on January 25, 1979. The HPC's jurisdiction regarding the property is defined per § 345-30, entitled Historic Preservation Review Procedures:

- a. *No permit shall be issued or amended nor shall any construction, alteration, minor alteration, ordinary maintenance and repair or demolition be started on a landmark building nor on any sign, building, structure, object, site or landscape feature within a designated historic district, whether or not a construction permit is required, prior to a filing of an application for review by the Historic Preservation Commission or the issuance of either a Certificate of Appropriateness or a Certificate of No Effect.*

Additionally, per 2(a), *"The Historic Preservation Officer shall refer all applications for **new construction, alterations, relocation or demolition** to the Historic Preservation Commission for review."*

IV. REQUIREMENTS AND STANDARDS FOR CONSIDERATION

Staff notes regarding the Powers and Duties of the Historic Preservation Commission:

Per § 345-9, entitled Historic Preservation Commission, Section (B) entitled Powers and Duties of the Historic Preservation Commission, the Commission has the following relevant powers and duties:

- (4) To advise and assist City officers, employees, boards and other bodies, including those at County, regional, State and Federal levels, on all matters which have potential impact on the landmark buildings, sites, structures, object or landscape features in the City or on the ambience of a historic district.
- (17) To issue Certificates of Appropriateness or Certificates of No Effect in accordance with the rules and standards set forth herein.

The property is subject to following standards during the Board's consideration regarding the application seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness:

1. *Secretary of Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*
2. *City of Jersey City Zoning Ordinance § 345-58 entitled H - Historic District*
3. *City of Jersey City Zoning Ordinance § 345-71 entitled Historic Design Standards*
4. *City of Jersey City Historic Preservation Commission Rules & Regulations for Alterations & Additions to Buildings & New Construction in Historic Districts*

V. STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS AND COMMENTS

The scope and impact of the proposed project represented by the plans were reviewed according to the City of Jersey City Zoning Ordinance § 345-30 entitled Historic Preservation Review Procedures, the City of Jersey City Zoning Ordinance § 345-71 entitled Historic Design Standards and by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Preservation, as adopted by the ordinance.

HPC Staff finds the application to be mostly consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Preservation. The new proposed rear addition and roof deck will be obliquely visible from the public right of way through an undeveloped lot on 8th Street. The building at 219 Pavonia has a similar condition, a rear yard addition that is visible through the same lot, and there does not appear to be an adverse effect as a result. The applicant is proposing this addition to be visually consistent with the historic materials found in the district, which will lessen its visual impact. Additionally, the block site plan on sheet HPC-1 shows other buildings with similar bulk and rear yard setbacks, including on either side of 217 Pavonia. Therefore, this appears to be consistent with the existing block paradigm and the development patterns of the area.

In HPC Staff's opinion, the project as proposed will not cause an adverse effect on the character and/or integrity of the historic resources or the Hamilton Park Historic District. HPC Staff recommends approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. The architect, Nelson Benavides, RA, shall be retained during construction and shall submit as-built, signed and sealed drawings to staff, or a signed and sealed letter representing and noting that site construction was consistent with work approved under this Certificate of Appropriateness before the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy.
2. Details, Specifications, and Material Submissions not currently submitted to and approved by the HPC under this Certificate of Appropriateness, such as shop drawings for the front façade windows, doors, or brick samples for the rear addition, or changed during the course of construction are remanded back to the HPC or shall be reviewed by HPC Staff.
3. Construction drawings, noting materials and finishes, cross-referenced with the material sample board, are to be reviewed by, approved by and signed by the Historic Preservation Officer or HPC Staff for compliance with the issued Certificate of Appropriateness before construction permits are applied for and issued.
4. Any changes or deviations from the approved drawings are to be clearly bubbled on the construction drawings and noted in an accompanying signed and sealed letter from the architect addressed to Staff for review. Depending on the degree of change or deviation, additional review by the HPC may be required.
5. Upon final approval of this Certificate by the HPC, any deviations from the granted approval must be approved by the HPC, except in cases of emergency affecting the public safety, health and welfare, which may be approved by HPC Staff. Any changes or deviations from the approved plans over the course of construction shall be submitted to HPC Staff in writing from the architect of record for approval on an as-needed basis. Changes or deviations that result in new work may require a new application to the HPC for said work.