

RESOLUTION
City of Jersey City
In the Matter of 15th and Grove JC LLC
619 GROVE STREET AND 610-620 GROVE STREET
BLOCK 7102, LOT 7; BLOCK 7103, LOTS 12-17

P19-163/168
Decided August 11, 2020
Memorialized on September 22, 2020
Application for Preliminary and Final Major Site Plan with Design Waivers

WHEREAS, on October 18, 2019, 15th and Grove JC LLC (“Applicant”) made application to the Jersey City Planning Board (“Planning Board”) for preliminary and final major site plan approval with design waivers for the development of property located at 619 Grove Street and 610-620 Grove Street and designated as Block 7102, Lot 7 and Block 7103, Lots 12-17 on the Tax Map of the City of Jersey City (the “Property”); and

WHEREAS, the proposed development will consist of a 23-story mixed use building consisting of 5,600 square feet of commercial space, an enclosed parking garage and 444 residential units (including 13 affordable housing units) on Block 7102, Lot 7 (the “St Lucy’s Parcel”); and

WHEREAS, the St. Lucy’s Parcel will include preservation of portions of the front facades of three existing St. Lucy’s buildings (church, rectory and former school/current shelter) on the St. Lucy’s parcel; and

WHEREAS, the existing homeless shelter on the St. Lucy’s Parcel will be relocated to a new five (5)-story building across Grove Street on Block 7103, Lots 12-17 (the “Public Benefit Parcel”) which is also being proposed as part of the application. The five (5)-story building will contain community space, space for administrative and counseling services, and a homeless shelter with 151 emergency beds (120 men’s shelter, 31 women’s shelter) and 14 units of transitional

housing for men with HIV (Franciska) for a total of 165 beds, the St. Jude's Oasis apartments which contain five (5) units of permanent supportive housing which are three (3) bedroom units for homeless households with children, and the Apartments at St. Lucy's which will contain 15 units of permanent affordable housing, all of which will be owned and operated by Catholic Charities of the Archdiocese of Newark. The "St. Lucy's Parcel" and the "Public Benefit Parcel" are part of and collectively referred to as the "Application".

WHEREAS, the Property is located within the Jersey Avenue Light Rail Redevelopment Area and subject to the requirements of the Jersey Avenue Light Rail Redevelopment Plan, as amended February 27, 2019, to include the St. Lucy's Overlay Bonus provisions; and

WHEREAS, a public hearing was held on the subject application for preliminary and final major site plan with design waiver relief before the Planning Board on August 11, 2020; and

WHEREAS, the Applicant was represented at the hearing by Jennifer M. Porter, Esq. of the law firm Chiesa Shahinian & Giantomasi, PC; and

WHEREAS, it is noted that notice of the public hearing was provided in accordance with N.J.S.A. 40:55D-12 and City Code Section 345-19; and

WHEREAS, the Applicant requested design waivers from the Jersey City Forestry Standards, 2018, as follows:

- (1) A waiver for the number of street trees required per Jersey City Forestry Standards to permit 13 street trees on Block 7102 (St. Lucy's Parcel) where 19 street trees are required and to permit 5 street trees on Block 7103 (Public Benefit Parcel) where 10 street trees are required;
- (2) A waiver for Block 7102 (St. Lucy's Parcel) to permit less than the minimum distance required between trees (trunk to trunk);

- (3) A waiver for Block 7102 (St. Lucy's Parcel) to permit less than the minimum distance required from a street light or utility pole to the tree trunk;
- (4) A waiver for Block 7102 (St. Lucy's Parcel) to permit tree pits that are not contiguous to the street curb as required;
- (5) A waiver for Block 7103 (Public Benefit Parcel) to permit less than the minimum distance required from a street light or utility pole to the tree trunk; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Board has reviewed all supporting materials submitted by the Applicant in advance of the public hearing, including but not limited to, the following that were posted as .pdfs and labeled with the below descriptions on the Jersey City Data Portal and are incorporated herein by reference along with all other application materials and submissions filed by the Applicant:

- a. City of Jersey City General Development Application for the St. Lucy's Parcel - Shelter Facility and attachments;
- b. City of Jersey City General Development Application for the Public Benefit Parcel – Residential Tower and attachments;
- c. Affidavits of Performance and Ownership and Tax Certificates;
- d. Project Presentation St. Lucy's MVMK submission slides;
- e. Survey for Shelter Block 7103, Lots 12-17;
- f. Survey for Tower Block 7102, Lot 7;
- g. CIVIL Plans - Entire Project - Both Sites;
- h. CIVIL Plans in Color Select Sheets - Both Sites;
- i. Architectural Plans - Public Benefit Parcel - Shelter and Apartments;
- j. Architectural Plans - St Lucy Parcel - Residential Tower;
- k. Engineering Report - Entire Project;

- l. Stormwater Management Report - Entire Project;
- m. Structural Engineering - Phase I Structural Church Shoring Plans;
- n. Structural Engineering - Phase II Church New to Old Plans;
- o. St Lucys - Structural Survey Report 11.5.18;
- p. St Lucys - Structural Survey Report 1.31.18;
- q. Historic Overview and Narrative of Work Report - St. Lucy's;
- r. Material Booklet - Public Benefit Parcel - Shelter Exterior Finishes;
- s. Material Board - St Lucy Residential Tower 2020-07-09 MVMK;
- t. St Lucy's Material Specs PART I;
- u. St Lucy's Material Specs PART II;
- v. NOTICE Final Affidavit of Proof of Publication-AES-St Lucy's 7.8.2020;
- w. STAFF MEMO P19-168 610-620 Grove and 619 Grove;
- x. JC Engineering MEMO 7.15.2020.pdf;
- y. H19-579_HPC_Recommendation to PB_07202020; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Board has also heard and considered the sworn testimony of the Applicant's witnesses who were accepted as experts in their respective fields by the Planning Board:

- a. Gabrielle Gornelli, P.E. of Dresdner Robin;
- b. Lauren Venin, LLA, RLA, CFM of Dresdner Robin;
- c. Ciaran Kelly, AIA of MVMK Architecture & Design;
- d. Steven Cohen, AIA of Steven S. Cohen Architecture;
- e. John Westervelt, Chief Executive Officer of Catholic Charities of the Archdiocese of Newark;
- f. Richard Sciarretta, Managing Partner of Claremont Development; and

g. Edward Kolling, PP, AICP, LLA of Dresdner Robin; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Board further considered the evidence presented by the Applicant and accepted into evidence as follows:

- a. Exhibit A-1: Proof that notice of the hearing was duly published and mailed in accordance with the requirements of the Municipal Land Use Law, N.J.S.A. 40:55D-1 et seq. (“MLUL”); and
- b. Exhibit A-2: JCHPC recommendation, H19-486; and

NOW, THEREFORE, the Planning Board makes the following findings of fact based upon the filed materials as well as the evidence and testimony presented at the aforesaid public hearing:

1. The Application consists of the St. Lucy’s Parcel and the Public Benefit Parcel.
2. The Applicant seeks preliminary and final site plan approval with design waiver relief to construct:
 - (a) a 23-story mixed use building consisting of 5,600 square feet of commercial space, an enclosed parking garage and 444 residential units (including 13 affordable housing units) on the St Lucy’s Parcel (Block 7102, Lot 7) which will include preservation of portions of the front facades of three existing St. Lucy’s buildings (church, rectory and former school/current shelter) on the St. Lucy’s parcel; and
 - (b) the existing homeless shelter on the St. Lucy’s Parcel will be relocated to a new five (5)-story building across Grove Street on the Public Benefit Parcel (Block 7103, Lots 12-17) which is also being proposed as part of the application. The five (5)-story building will contain community space, space for administrative

and counseling services, and a homeless shelter with 151 emergency beds (120 men's shelter, 31 women's shelter) and 14 units of transitional housing for men with HIV (Franciska) for a total of 165 beds, the St. Jude's Oasis apartments which contain five (5) units of permanent supportive housing which are three (3) bedroom units for homeless households with children, and the Apartments at St. Lucy's which will contain 15 units of permanent affordable housing, all of which will be owned and operated by Catholic Charities of the Archdiocese of Newark.

1. The proposed uses are permitted on the Property per the regulations of the Jersey Avenue Light Rail Redevelopment Plan.
2. The Applicant's first witness, Gabrielle Gornelli, P.E. of Dresdner Robin, who was qualified and sworn as an expert in civil engineering, testified with regard to the existing site conditions, applicable zoning and redevelopment plan requirements, and the proposed development including, but not limited to the overall site plan layout and improvements, shared parking for the St. Lucy's Parcel and Public Benefit Parcel on the St. Lucy's Parcel and compliance with the Memo of Lichuan Wang, P.E. C.M.E. from the Division of Engineering, Traffic and Transportation dated July 15, 2020.
3. The Applicant's next witness, Lauren Venin, LLA, RLA, CFM of Dresdner Robin, who was qualified and sworn as an expert in landscape architecture, testified with regard to landscaping as shown on the overall site plan rendering and site plan renderings for the St. Lucy's Parcel and Public Benefit Parcel, as well as the work within and outside of the 15th and 16th Street rights-of-way, including sidewalks, bicycle parking and landscape plantings and street trees. Ms. Venin also testified regarding the design of

the plaza and site furniture on the St. Lucy's Parcel and provided justification for the design waivers from the 2018 Jersey City Forestry Standards.

4. The Applicant's next witness, Ciaran Kelly from MVMK, who was qualified and sworn as an expert in architecture, testified with respect to the architecture for the St. Lucy's parcel, including the a description of the site and surrounding area, existing St. Lucy's buildings and the proposed building envelope.
5. Mr. Kelly also testified regarding the building elevations and floor plans for the residential and commercial space as well as the parking and amenity space, the residential unit mix, building and site lighting, the overall building sections, materials and finishes, views and perspectives and presented a rendering animation of the building.
6. Mr. Kelly also addressed the history of the existing church, rectory and former school/current shelter on the St. Lucy's Parcel and detailed the significant efforts that will be taken to incorporate and preserve the key character-defining features of the three buildings, including the street facades along Grove Street and 15th Street and other historic elements of these buildings in coordination with Jersey City historic preservation staff and the recommendations of the Historic Planning Commission.
7. The Applicant's next witness, Steven Cohen, who was qualified and sworn as an expert in architecture, testified with respect to the architecture for the public benefit parcel, including the building elevations, floor plans for the different types of shelter bedding and services and housing units as well as the materials and finishes for the proposed building.

8. The Applicant's next witness, John Westervelt, Chief Executive Officer of Catholic Charities of the Archdiocese of Newark, testified regarding the history of Catholic Charities and the services they provide, the history of the existing St. Lucy's shelter and the social services it provides, the proposed St. Lucy's shelter and the services it will provide, the beds that will be provided and individuals it will serve.
9. Mr. Westervelt also testified as to the St. Jude's Oasis permanent supportive housing and the St. Lucy's permanent affordable housing units that will be provided, the safety and security aspects of the proposed facilities and the overall need for the shelter and related services.
10. The Applicant's next witness, Richard Sciaretta, Managing Partner of Claremont Development, testified with regard to the construction timeline and phasing of the development of the St. Lucy's Parcel and Public Benefit Parcel.
11. The Applicant's next witness, Edward Kolling, a licensed professional planner in the State of New Jersey, who was sworn and qualified as an expert in planning testified in support of the Application and the design waiver relief that the Applicant was seeking from the provisions of the 2018 Jersey City Forestry Standards.
12. Specifically, Mr. Kolling testified that the project was in compliance with the requirements for the St. Lucy's Overlay Bonus set forth in the Jersey Avenue Light Rail Redevelopment Plan.
13. Mr. Kolling further testified that the design waivers were justified because they allow for egress to the building, they allow for the location of the historic fencing and maintain the historic characters of the entranceways and other things of that nature,

which is one of the principal intents and purposes of the St. Lucy's bonus overlay provisions under the Jersey Avenue Light Rail Redevelopment Plan.

14. Additionally, Mr. Kolling testified it was his opinion that granting the requested design relief would not result in a substantial detriment to the general welfare nor substantial detriment to the intent and purpose of the zone plan and zoning ordinance and that the substantial benefits of the project outweigh any detriments since the project is consistent with the Jersey Avenue Light Rail Redevelopment Plan objectives and Jersey City Master Plan (2000) goals.

15. Following Mr. Kolling's testimony, the hearing was opened to the public and no members of the public commented concerning the subject application.

16. The City's Principal Planner, Matt Ward, referenced the HPC recommendations to the Planning Board, H19-486, the City Planning Staff Memo dated July 13, 2020 and the July 15, 2020 Jersey City Engineering Memo and acknowledged applicant's compliance with the conditions of same in the event a motion was made to approve the application by the Planning Board set forth below.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED by the Planning Board that it has reviewed all the evidence and testimony of the Applicant's witness, which it has deemed to be credible and reliable.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Applicant has met the requirements of the Municipal Land Use Law, case law, City Ordinances and Jersey Avenue Light Rail Redevelopment Plan so as to grant the relief requested for preliminary and final major site plan approval with design waivers from the 2018 Jersey City Forestry Standards based on the reasons articulated and presented by the Applicant's professional planner. Specifically, the

Planning Board finds that the Applicant has satisfied its burden of proof and has demonstrated that relief is warranted.

The Applicant has further demonstrated and the Planning Board finds that the design waivers may be granted without causing substantial detriment to the public good and public welfare. Further, the design waivers will not cause a substantial detriment to the intent and purposes of the Zone Plan or the Master Plan. The Applicant has demonstrated and the Planning Board finds that the intent and purposes of the Jersey Avenue Light Rail Redevelopment Plan and Jersey City Master Plan (2000) are advanced by this project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED by the Planning Board of the City of Jersey City that the application of 15th and Grove JC LLC seeking for preliminary and final major site plan with design waivers is approved subject to the following terms and conditions:

1. All materials and color selections shall be shown on Final Plans. No change to the facade and site design, including materials as well as any changes that may be required by the Office of Construction Code, shall be permitted without consultation with and approval by planning staff.
2. All testimony given by the applicant and their expert witnesses in accordance with this application shall be binding.
3. That the applicant comply with all Jersey City review agent comments.
4. With exception of the proposed tree spacing, all street trees and landscaping shall be installed in accordance with 345-66, prior to an issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy.
5. Applicant shall comply with the conditions of the recommendation made by the Historic Preservation Commission on July 20, 2020, which is attached hereto as exhibit “A”.
6. Architects of record shall provide an affidavit confirming the development is built in accordance with the approved plans prior to the issuance of the first certificate of occupancy.

7. The memorialized resolution shall be recorded with the office of the County Registrar and made part of the deeds of the two sites. In addition, documentation of same shall be submitted to the Division of City Planning prior to application for construction permits.

8. The applicant and the operator of the shelter shall comply with the rules and regulations of Jersey City Municipal Code, Chapter 188 – Housing Accommodations and Affordable Housing Compliance.

9. Applicant and Owners shall comply with all conditions of approval set forth on the record by the planning board and/or the Division of City Planning staff.

RESOLUTION
City of Jersey City
In the Matter of 15th and Grove JC LLC

619 GROVE STREET AND 610-620 GROVE STREET
BLOCK 7102, LOT 7; BLOCK 7103, LOTS 12-17


P19-163/168
Decided August 11, 2020
Memorialized on September 22, 2020
Application for Preliminary and Final Major Site Plan with Waivers

DATE OF HEARING: August 11, 2020
VOTE: September 22, 2020


VOTE:
Motion made by: Commissioner Gonzalez Motion Seconded by: Commissioner Cruz

COMMISSIONER	YES	NO	ABSTAIN	ABSENT
Christopher Langston, Chairman	X			
Dr. Orlando V. Gonzalez, Vice-Chairman	X			
Joyce Watterman	X			
Gregory Allen	X			
Harkesh Thakur	X			
David Cruz	X			
Peter Horton	X			


Christopher Langston (Sep 23, 2020 16:32 EDT)
CHRISTOPHER LANGSTON, Chairman
JERSEY CITY PLANNING BOARD


Erica Baptiste (Sep 23, 2020 09:20 EDT)
MATTHEW WARD, Secretary
JERSEY CITY PLANNING BOARD

APPROVED AS TO LEGAL FORM:


Santo T Alampi (Sep 24, 2020 12:23 EDT)
SANTO ALAMPI, ESQ.
JERSEY CITY PLANNING BOARD

DATE OF MEMORIALIZATION: September 22, 2020

EXHIBIT “A”



JERSEY CITY HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

619 Grove Street H19-486

Former St. Lucy's Roman Catholic Complex

Partial Demolition and Selective Facade Restoration integrated into

23-story New Residential Construction

**RECOMMENDATION TO THE
JERSEY CITY PLANNING BOARD**

Applicant:
15TH AND GROVE JC LLC
49 US 202
FAR HILLS, NJ

Owner:
ROMAN CATHOLIC ARCHDIOCESE OF NEWARK
171 CLIFTON AVE - BOX 9500
NEWARK NJ 07104

Following a hearing on July 20, 2020, the Jersey City HPC is recommending that the Jersey City Planning Board approve the above project at 619 Grove St a/k/a the former St. Lucy's Roman Catholic Complex consisting of: approval for the partial demolition of the church, rectory, and school buildings and the restoration of the remaining facades, and the integration of the remaining facades into the construction of a 23-story residential tower.

619 Grove Street (herein referred to as "The Property") is located in what was formerly referred to as *the Horseshoe* section of Jersey City. The property is located on an oversized (200x175 ft) fronting Grove Street between 15th Street and 16th Street, just north of the Holland Tunnel. The property falls within the Jersey Ave Light Rail Redevelopment Plan. As this property falls within above redevelopment plan, this application comes to the HPC as directed by Section X subset C.5.D.XI of the redevelopment plan. The Complex has been designated as eligible for inclusion on the State and National Registers of Historic Places as *St. Lucy's Roman Catholic Complex, Perpetual Novena of St. Jude Thaddeus (ID#44) 611,615,621 Grove Street; 206 15th Street* in an opinion rendered by the New Jersey State Historic Preservation Office dated 1/11/2000.

After reviewing the proposed project, its application materials outlined in detail in the attached Staff report, Staff finds that the proposal is mostly consistent with the objectives in the Jersey Ave Light Rail Redevelopment Plan, St Lucy Overlay Bonus. While Staff recognizes the demolition of the majority of each building, demolition of interior spaces, and the visual diminishment of the historic features by the larger new construction, shall have an adverse effect on the complex, Staff recognizes that the applicant has made a good faith effort to preserve, restore and rehabilitate the remaining portion of the character defining, visible, historic fabric.

The HPC recommend approval of the project to the Jersey City Planning Board with the following conditions:

1. For any element that the applicant is proposing to replace with an "exact replica" if necessary, for any reason, HPC Staff shall review and approve detailed drawings and any mockups of said element prior to manufacture, purchase, and/or installation.
2. The applicant shall prepare a mock up of the proposed synthetic slate roof at an appropriate angle replicating the historic roof slope for HPC Staff to review and approve prior to purchase, manufacture, and/or installation of any roofing materials.

3. Mock ups of proposed pointing, masonry cleaning, paint removal shall be approved by the applicant's historic preservation professional and the City's HPO on site in accordance with industry standards.
4. On A- 300 in the "Cornice/Gutter/Roof" notes, the applicant states a new cross "may" be installed at the top of the bell tower and on the center peak. Staff notes that on page A-400, detail 1, the plans states that the bronze cross on top of the bell tower and on top of the center gable shall remain. The applicant shall clarify the notes to remove the word "may" and indicate that both crosses will remain in place as they are character defining features and important details in the overall design of the building.
5. The applicant shall revise the new aluminum louver detail on page A-400 to reflect that the new louvers shall match the existing wood louvers in terms of configuration, size, profile, material and details. Staff encourages the repair and reconstruction of the louvers in the original materials, incorporating sound existing historic fabric as is practicable. The use of aluminum at the louvers is discouraged as incompatible with the remaining, surrounding historic fabric.
6. The applicant has agreed to with HPC staff to determine an appropriate stained glass/leaded glass design for the east façade rose window based on existing examples of glass found at the Church building. The proposed, dark reflective spandrel glass at the rose window is inappropriate given the importance of the rose window's importance as a character-defining feature of the façade on the front façade of the former church. Furthermore, the applicant shall work with HPC staff to determine an appropriate stained glass/leaded glass design for those areas where clear or spandrel glass is proposed in the current drawings of the church facades shown on page A-700.
7. All arched topped windows for the former rectory as shown in elevation on Page A-701 # w15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20 21 and 22 shall be resubmitted as properly proportioned and detailed with the meeting rail centered between the window sill and the apex/centrepoint of the arch.
8. All window details shall be approved by the applicant/owner's historic preservation professional, and architect before submission to the City's HPO before purchase, fabrication and installation. The new windows are to match the historic windows in all respects, especially configuration, operation, details, material, and finish. Particular attention is to be paid to the setting of the windows on the same plane as the existing, historic windows and the replication of historic brickmolds and casings.
9. The Applicant shall provide a detailed drawing of the existing fence that is to be cleaned, repaired, and showing how it will be reinstalled throughout the site.
10. The newel posts at the former school entrance shall be retained and reinstalled on site to the greatest extent possible while allowing sensitive alterations to accommodate the proposed, new, finish floor level.
11. All proposed paint colors at the former church, rectory and school building shall be based on historic site evidence and shall be approved by the City's HPO on site in consultation with the applicant's historic preservation professional.
12. Site evidence shall be the arbiter of the restoration and rehabilitation of the building facades and shall be documented and consulted throughout the project for material direction.
13. The applicant shall work with HPC Staff to revise the proposed entrance sidewalk material and the landscaping on the elevation facing Grove Street.
14. HPC Staff shall review any proposed signage at the site, lighting related to the signage, and any proposed building lighting.
15. The owner's historic preservation professional, Heritage Consulting Group, who they are required to retain per the redevelopment plan, shall review all samples, details, shop drawings, mock ups and other necessary submissions before submission to the architect of record before approval is granted by the HPO.
16. The architect, MVMK Architecture + Design, shall be retained during construction and shall submit all samples, details, shop drawings, mock ups and other necessary submissions to the Historic Preservation Office before the purchase, manufacture and installation of any material or service at the historic facades of the Former Saint Lucy's Parochial Complex.
17. In conjunction with conditions 8, 9, and 10 above, Details, Specifications, and Material Submissions not currently submitted to and approved by the HPC under this recommendation, or changed during the course of construction are remanded back to the HPC at the discretion of the HPO.
18. Construction drawings, noting materials and finishes, cross-referenced with the material sample board, are to be reviewed by, approved by and signed by the Historic Preservation Officer or HPC Staff for compliance with the issued approval before construction permits are applied for and issued.

19. Any changes or deviations from the approved drawings are to be clearly bubbled on the construction drawings and noted in an accompanying signed and sealed letter from the architect addressed to Staff.

20. Upon final review and recommendation of this project by the HPC, any deviations from the granted approval must be approved by the HPC before implementation, except in cases of emergency affecting the public safety, health and welfare. Requests for deviations from this recommendation for approval are to be submitted through written request of the architect directly to the attention of the City's HPO.

21. As noted during prior discussions with HPC staff, the statue of Saint Jude, which had acquired its own significance during the twentieth century, shall be relocated to another Archdiocesan property across the street at the proposed location of a new archdiocesan social service facility or another close location so that the statue's ties with the neighborhood shall not be broken.

This Certificate of No Effect is issued on the basis of the building and site conditions described in the application and disclosed during the review process. By accepting this Certificate of No Effect, the applicant agrees to notify the Commission if the actual building or site conditions vary or if original or historic building fabric is discovered. The Commission reserves the right to amend or revoke this permit, upon written notice to the applicant, in the event that the actual building or site conditions are materially different from those described in the application or disclosed during the review process.

This Certificate Shall be Posted During Construction

Certificate of Appropriateness H19-579 Approved 7-0-0

Robert Gordon, Chair Paul Amatuzzo, Commissioner

man

Attest: Margaret A. O'Neill, Historic Preservation Specialist

